2017 and 2019 CARIS Base Case Assumptions Matrix Comparison For Discussion at the June 25, 2019 ESPWG

(updates in RED)

Parameter	Modeling for 2017 CARIS Base Case	Modeling for 2019 CARIS Base Case
Peak Load	Based on 2017 Load & Capacity Data Report ("Gold Book") Baseline Forecast of Non-Coincident Peak Demand, including impacts of statewide Energy Efficiency programs (Table 1-2b-1)	Based on 2019 Load & Capacity Data Report ("Gold Book") Baseline Forecast of Non-Coincident Peak Demand, including impacts of statewide Energy Efficiency programs (Table 1-3a and 1-3b)
Load Shape Model Energy Forecast	2002 Load Shape. Energy Forecast based on 2017 Load & Capacity Data Report ("Gold Book") Baseline Forecast of Annual Energy, including impacts of statewide Energy Efficiency programs (Table 1-2a)	2002 Load Shape. Energy Forecast based on 2019 Load & Capacity Data Report ("Gold Book") Baseline Forecast of Annual Energy, including impacts of statewide Energy Efficiency programs (Table 1-2)
Load Uncertainty Model	Only Base Level Forecast utilized; the impact of energy or peak forecasts may be utilized in scenarios	Only Base Level Forecast utilized; the impact of energy or peak forecasts may be utilized in scenarios
Generating Unit Capacities	Updated to reflect 2017 Gold Book winter and summer DMNC values	Updated to reflect 2019 Gold Book winter and summer DMNC values
New Units	Updated as per 2017 Gold Book (Application of inclusion rules identified in Reliability Planning Process Manual, Section 3.1.1 and procedures)	Updated as per 2019 Gold Book (Application of inclusion rules identified in Reliability Planning Process Manual, Section 3.2 and procedures)
Wind Resource Modeling	Units and capacities updated as per 2017 Gold Book. Existing wind resources are modeled based on unit capacities and actual 2015 shapes. New units modeled based on proximate existing	Units and capacities updated as per 2019 Gold Book. Existing wind resources are modeled based on unit capacities and actual 2017 shapes. New units modeled based on proximate existing

Parameter	Modeling for 2017 CARIS Base Case	Modeling for 2019 CARIS Base Case
	units.	units.
Non-NYPA Hydro Capacity Modeling	Updated as per 2017 Gold Book; unit output is modeled consistent with historic levels.	Updated as per 2019 Gold Book; unit output is modeled consistent with historic levels.
Special Case Resources	Not utilized in MAPS production cost modeling; incorporated in ICAP Metric calculation	Not utilized in MAPS production cost modeling; incorporated in ICAP Metric calculation
EDRP Resources	N/A for production cost modeling	N/A for production cost modeling
External Capacity – Purchases and Wheel- Throughs	Flows across schedulable and non-schedulable transmission lines are based on economics.	Flows across schedulable and non-schedulable transmission lines are based on economics.
Retirements	Updated as per 2017 Gold Book (Application of inclusion rules; specific assumptions concerning mothball announcement post-CRP; units with completed studies indicating that the unit is required for reliability are retained in the Base Case; units whose studies are pending are retained in the Base Case; others are excluded from the Base Case)	Updated as per 2019 Gold Book (Application of inclusion rules; specific assumptions concerning mothball announcement post-CRP; units with completed studies indicating that the unit is required for reliability are retained in the Base Case; units whose studies are pending are retained in the Base Case; others are excluded from the Base Case; units filing compliance plans in response to regulatory mandates which indicate that the unit will retire will also be excluded)
Generator Outages	Scheduled to levelize reserves; as per the maintenance schedules in long term adequacy studies.	Scheduled to levelize reserves; as per the maintenance schedules in long term adequacy studies.
Gas Turbines Ambient	Modeling utilizes summer	Modeling utilizes summer

Parameter	Modeling for 2017 CARIS Base Case	Modeling for 2019 CARIS Base Case
Derate	and winter DMNC ratings for all units.	and winter DMNC ratings for all units.
Environmental Modeling Externalities Allowances	Allowance costs based on projected RGGI costs. SO ₂ and NO _x Allowance Prices reflect CSAPR markets.	TBD. Under review with ESPWG (as of 6/25/2019).
	Detailed allowance costs are provided in the 6/22/17 ESPWG meeting materials.	
Commitment and Dispatch Options	Each Balancing Authority commits to serve its own load, firm transactions, and potential transfers	Each Balancing Authority commits to serve its own load, firm transactions, and potential transfers
	Hurdle rates – flat. As presented on 6/22/17 to ESPWG.	Hurdle rates – flat Same. Precise values pending conclusion of benchmarking analysis. Will be reported to ESPWG.
Operating Reserves	Operating Reserves as per NYCA requirements.	Operating Reserves as per NYCA requirements.
Fuel Price Forecast	Annual bases updated to more heavily weight recent trends (2014-075., 2015-0.3, 2016-0.625).	Annual bases updated to more heavily weight recent trends (2016-0.075, 2017-0.3, 2018-0.625).
	Seasonality and spikes based on three-year history (2012-2016).	Seasonality and spikes based on three-year history (2014-2018).
	Calculated natural price forecasts based on blends of	Calculated natural price forecasts based on blends of

Parameter	Modeling for 2017 CARIS Base Case	Modeling for 2019 CARIS Base Case
	hub price forecasts for four hubs (A-E, F-I, J and K).	hub price forecasts for four hubs (A-E, F-I, J and K).
	Utilized unit capacities and reported pricing hubs to weight price forecasts.	Utilized historic unit production and reported pricing hubs to weight price forecasts.
	Fuel oil and coal price forecasts are developed utilizing the ElA's annual forecast of national delivered prices. Regional bases are derived using ElA Form 923 data. The seasonality for fuel oils is based on an analysis of New York Harbor Ultra-Low Sulfur Diesel (ULSD) prices. Coal has no seasonality.	Fuel oil and coal price forecasts are developed utilizing the ElA's annual forecast of national delivered prices. Regional bases are derived using ElA Form 923 data. The seasonality for fuel oils is based on an analysis of New York Harbor Ultra-Low Sulfur Diesel (ULSD) prices. Coal has no seasonality.
	Illustrative fuel costs are presented in the 8/28/17 ESPWG meeting materials.	Illustrative fuel costs are presented in the 8/28/17 ESPWG meeting materials.
Cost Curve Development (including heat rates and emission rates)	Unit heat rates (and emission rates) developed from vendor supplied data, USEPA CAMD fuel input and emissions data matched with NYISO production data for NYCA and USEIA production data for non NYCA units.	Unit heat rates (and emission rates) developed from vendor supplied data, USEPA CAMD fuel input and emissions data matched with NYISO production data for NYCA and USEIA production data for non NYCA units.
Local Reliability Rules	List and develop appropriate nomograms. Fuel burn restrictions, operating restrictions and exceptions, commitment/dispatch limits	List and develop appropriate nomograms. Fuel burn restrictions, operating restrictions and exceptions, commitment/dispatch limits
Energy Storage Gilboa PSH Lewiston PSH	Scheduling checked to conform to historical operations.	Scheduling checked to conform to historical operations.

Parameter	Modeling for 2017 CARIS Base Case	Modeling for 2019 CARIS Base Case
Transmission System Model		
Power Flow Cases	As per CRP.	As per CRP.
Interface Limits Monitored/contingency pairs	Data from the results of internal and external planning studies; vendor-supplied data; operational voltage studies; operational limits; transfer limit analysis	Data from the results of internal and external planning studies; vendor-supplied data; operational voltage studies; operational limits; transfer limit analysis
Nomograms	for critical interfaces.	for critical interfaces.
Joint, Grouping		
Unit Sensitive Voltage		
New Transmission Capability	Updated as per 2017 Gold Book (Application of base case inclusion rules)	Updated as per 2019 Gold Book (Application of base case inclusion rules)
Internal Controllable Lines (PARs,DC,VFT)	Optimized in simulation.	Optimized in simulation.
Neighboring Systems		
Outside World Area Models	Power flow data from CRP, "production" data developed by NYISO with vendor and	Power flow data from CRP, "production" data developed by NYISO with vendor and
Fuel Forecast	neighbor input. Fuel forecasts developed utilizing same methodology as NYCA fuel forecasts.	neighbor input. Fuel forecasts developed utilizing same methodology as NYCA fuel forecasts.
External Capacity And Load Forecast	Neighboring systems modeled consistent with reserve margins in the RNA/CRP analysis. Neighboring systems data reviewed and held at required reserve margin.	Neighboring systems modeled consistent with reserve margins in the RNA/CRP analysis. Neighboring systems data reviewed and held at required reserve margin.

Parameter	Modeling for 2017 CARIS Base Case	Modeling for 2019 CARIS Base Case
System representation in Simulation	HQ modeled as fixed hourly schedule, synchronized with all other external injections.	HQ modeled as fixed hourly schedule, synchronized with all other external injections.
	Full Representation/Participation: NYISO ISONE IESO PJM Classic & AP,AEP,CE,DLCO, DAY, VP, EKPC Proxy Bus Injection: HQ-NYISO, HQ-NE-ISO, NB-NEISO, HQ – IESO	Full Representation/Participation: NYISO ISONE IESO PJM Classic & AP, AEP, CE, DLCO, DAY, VP, EKPC Proxy Bus Injection: HQ-NYISO, HQ-NE-ISO, NB-NEISO, HQ – IESO Transmission Only/Zeroed
	Transmission Only/Zeroed Out: MECS,FE,SPP, MAR, NIPS,OVEC,TVA, FRCC,SERC,ERCOT,WECC	Out: MECS,FE,SPP, MAR, NIPS,OVEC,TVA, FRCC,SERC,ERCOT,WECC
External Controllable Lines (PARs,DC,VFT, Radial lines)	Western ties to carry 32% of PJM-NYISO AC Interchange + 20% of RECO Load	B and C modeled as out of service. Current JOA modeled under these outage conditions.
	5018 line to carry 32% of PJM-NYISO AC Interchange + 80% of RECO Load	Western ties to carry 46% of PJM-NYISO AC Interchange + 20% of RECO Load
	PAR ABC to carry 21% of PJM-NYISO AC Interchange + 400 MW OBF (note: OBF to 0 as of 6/1/2021)	5018 line to carry 32% of PJM-NYISO AC Interchange + 80% of RECO Load
	PAR JK to carry 15% of PJM-NYISO AC Interchange - 400 MW OBF (note: OBF to 0 as of 6/1/2021)	PAR A to carry 7% of PJM- NYISO AC Interchange + 100 MW OBF (note: OBF to 0 as of 11/1/2019)
	Norwalk (-200MW, +200MW) L33,34 (-300MW, +300MW) PV20 (0MW, +150MW) Neptune (0MW, +660MW)	PAR JK to carry 15% of PJM-NYISO AC Interchange - 100 MW OBF (note: OBF to 0 as of 11/1/2019)

Parameter	Modeling for 2017 CARIS Base Case	Modeling for 2019 CARIS Base Case
	CSC (0MW, +330MW) CSC and Neptune optimized subject to "cost of use" HTP (0, 660) Linden VFT (-315,315)	Norwalk (-200MW, +200MW) L33,34 (-300MW, +300MW) PV20 (0MW, +150MW) Neptune (0MW, +660MW) CSC (0MW, +330MW) CSC and Neptune optimized subject to "cost of use" HTP (0, 660) Linden VFT (-315,315)